

FILED

08 AUG 21 PM 1:58

CLERK, U.S. DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

BY:

fcl

DEPUTY

1 Tina I. Mangarpan, Esq., Bar No. 117898
2 FORD, WALKER, HAGGERTY & BEHAR
3 One World Trade Center
4 Twenty-Seventh Floor
5 Long Beach, California 90831-2700
6 (562) 983-2500

7 Attorneys for Defendant, COLONY CONSOLIDATED, LP

8 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
9 SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

10 LENETTE BARKER,

11 Plaintiff,

12 vs.

13 HIHC, LLC, A California Limited Liability
14 Company; COLONY CONSOLIDATED, L.P.,
15 A Limited Partnership, and DOES 1 through
16 100, inclusive

17 Defendants.

18 NO 08 CV 1547 LAB RBB

19 NOTICE OF REMOVAL OF ACTION
20 UNDER 28 U.S.C. SECTION 1441(b)
21 FEDERAL QUESTION

22 TO THE CLERK OF THE ABOVE-ENTITLED COURT:

23 PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that defendant, COLONY CONSOLIDATED, LP, hereby
24 removes to this Court the state court action described below.

25 1. On July 16, 2008, an action was commenced in the Superior Court of the State of
26 California, County of San Diego, entitled LENETTE BARKER v. HIHC, LLC, A California
27 Limited Liability Company; COLONY CONSOLIDATED, L.P., A Limited Partnership, Does 1
28 through 100, Inclusive, as Case Number 37-2008-00087782-CU-CR-CTL. A copy of the
Complaint is attached hereto as Exhibit "A."

1 2. The first date upon which defendant received a copy of said Complaint was July
2 23, 2008.

3 3. This action is a civil action of which the Court has original jurisdiction under 28
4 U.S.C. Section 1331, and is one which may be removed to this Court by defendant pursuant to
5 the provisions of 28 U.S.C. Section 1441(b) in that it arises under statutes of the United States:
6 specifically, the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990, Title III, 42 U.S.C.S. 12101, et seq.

7 4. There are no other named defendants to defendant's knowledge that have been
8 served with the Summons and Complaint. The defendants identified as "Does 1 through 100" in
9 plaintiff's Complaint are merely fictitious parties against whom no cause of action can be validly
10 alleged.

11 5. This notice is filed within thirty (30) days after defendant's initial notice of this
12 action.

13 6. Following the filing of this notice with this Court, written notice of the filing of
14 same will be provided to all attorneys of record, as required by law.

15 7. Following the filing of this notice with this Court, a true and correct copy of same
16 will be filed with the Clerk of the Superior Court of the State of California, County of Los
17 Angeles, as required by law.

18 8. Attached as Exhibit "A" to this notice is a true and legible copy of all process,
19 pleadings, orders and other papers or exhibits of every kind on file in the Superior Court of the
20 State of California, County of Los Angeles.

21 ///

22 ///

23 ///

24 ///

25 ///

26 ///

27 ///

28 ///

BY: Tina I. Mangarpan
TINA I. MANGARPAN, ESQ.
Attorneys for Defendant,
COLONY CONSOLIDATED, LP

K:\CLIENT\08M\09\017\Pleadings\PL Ntc Removal.doc

(PROOF OF SERVICE BY MAIL – F.R.Civ.P. 5)
BARKER v. HIHC, LLC, et al.
USDC SOUTHERN DISTRICT

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

I am employed in the aforesaid county; I am over the age of eighteen years and not a party to the within entitled action; my business address is: One World Trade Center, Twenty-Seventh Floor, Long Beach, California 90831-2700

On August 21, 2008, I served the within: **NOTICE OF REMOVAL OF ACTION UNDER 28 U.S.C. SECTION 1441(b) FEDERAL QUESTION** on the interested parties in said action,

by personally delivering it to the person(s) indicated below in the manner as provided in FRCivP5(b);

X by depositing it in the United States Mail at Long Beach, California, in a sealed envelope with the postage fully prepaid to the following;

Mark D. Potter, Esq.
Russell C. Handy, Esq.
CENTER FOR DISABILITY ACCESS, LLP
100 East San Marcos Blvd., Suite 400
San Marcos, CA 92069-2988
(760) 480-4162; (760) 480-4170 Fax

I hereby certify that I am a member of the Bar of the United States District Court, Central District of California.

X I hereby certify that I am employed in the office of a member of the Bar of this Court at whose direction the service was made.

X I hereby certify under the penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on August 21, 2008, at Long Beach, California.


Barbara A. Ezra

CIVIL
JUL 15 P 4 25

1 CENTER FOR DISABILITY ACCESS, LLP
2 MARK D. POTTER, ESQ., SBN 166317
3 RUSSELL C. HANDY, ESQ., SBN 195058
4 100 East San Marcos Blvd., Suite 400
San Marcos, CA 92069-2988
(760) 480-4162
Fax (760) 480-4170

5 Attorney for Plaintiff, LENETTE BARKER

6
7
8 IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
9 IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO

10 LENETTE BARKER,

11
12 Plaintiff,

13 v.

14 HIHC, LLC, A California Limited
15 Liability Company; COLONY
16 CONSOLIDATED, L.P., A Limited
Partnership, and DOES 1 through 100,
inclusive

17 Defendants.

Case No.: 37-2008-00087782-CU-CR-CTL

COMPLAINT FOR DAMAGES AND
INJUNCTIVE RELIEF FOR
VIOLATIONS OF: AMERICAN'S
WITH DISABILITIES ACT; UNRUH
CIVIL RIGHTS ACT; CALIFORNIA
DISABLED PERSONS ACT;
NEGLIGENCE

DEMAND FOR JURY

18
19
20 Plaintiffs LENETTE BARKER complains of Defendants HIHC, LLC, A
21 California Limited Liability Company; COLONY CONSOLIDATED, L.P., A Limited
22 Partnership, and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive, (hereinafter referred to as
23 "Defendants") and alleges as follows:

24 **PARTIES:**

25 1. Plaintiff is a California resident with physical disabilities. She suffers from
26 Multiple Sclerosis and requires a wheelchair for mobility.

27 2. Defendants are or were at the time of the incident the owners and operators
28 and/or lessors and lessees of the Hotel located at 631 Camino Del Rio South, San

1 Diego, California.

2 3. Plaintiff does not know the true names of Defendants, their business
3 capacities, their ownership connection to the property and business, or their relative
4 responsibilities in causing the access violations herein complained of, and alleges a
5 joint venture and common enterprise by all such Defendants. Plaintiff is informed and
6 believes that each of the Defendants herein, including DOES 1 through 100, inclusive,
7 is responsible in some capacity for the events herein alleged, or is a necessary party for
8 obtaining appropriate relief. Plaintiff will seek leave to amend when the true names,
9 capacities, connections, and responsibilities of the Defendants and DOES 1 through
10 100, inclusive, are ascertained

11 **FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS:**

12 4. The Hotel is a facility open to the public, a place of public accommodation,
13 and a business establishment.

14 5. The Plaintiff stayed with family members at the Hotel March 12 and 13,
15 2008.

16 6. During her visit, the Plaintiff encountered various violations of the Americans
17 with Disabilities Act Accessibility Guidelines ("ADAAG") and Title 24 of the
18 California Code of Regulations, including, but not limited to, the accessible rooms in
19 the Hotel were not dispersed among the various classes of sleeping accommodations to
20 provide a range of options applicable to room sizes, costs, amenities provided, and the
21 number of beds provided.

22 7. Naturally, Plaintiff BARKER was frustrated, angry and/or vexed as a result of
23 encountering these conditions, these violations of her civil rights, and the lack of safe,
24 convenient and accessible facilities. Although these injuries are modest in scope and
25 did not result in any loss of wages or economic damage or medical care or attention, the
26 continued violation of the Plaintiff's civil rights by these defendants and the highly
27 unpleasant emotional distress caused by such unlawful treatment is attributable to the
28 actions or inactions of the defendants and plaintiff seeks redress from these defendants

1 for such injury.

2 8. Plaintiff would like to return and patronize the Defendants' Hotel; however,
3 the Plaintiff is unable to use the Hotel on a "full and equal" basis until the Hotel is
4 brought into compliance with the provisions of the Americans with Disabilities Act
5 Accessibility Guidelines and state accessibility law as pled herein. Plaintiff has been
6 and currently is being deterred from returning and patronizing the Defendants' Hotel on
7 a full and equal basis.

8 **I. FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION: VIOLATION OF THE AMERICANS WITH**
9 **DISABILITIES ACT OF 1990 (On behalf of Plaintiff and Against All Defendants)**
(Cal Civ § 51-53)

10 9. The Defendants are persons who either own, operate, lease or lease to a
11 place of public accommodation. As such, the Defendants are required to (1) ensure that
12 all construction, alteration, or modification is barrier free and complies with the
13 Americans with Disabilities Act Accessibility Guidelines ("ADAAG") and Title 24 of
14 the California Code of Regulations (aka "California Building Code"); and/or (2)
15 remove all existing barriers where such removal is "readily achievable." The
16 Defendants have failed to meet these obligations. The existence of readily achievable
17 removed barriers and barriers in violation of the ADAAG and/or California Building
18 Code, including, but not limited to, the accessible rooms in the Hotel were not
19 dispersed among the various classes of sleeping accommodations to provide a range of
20 options applicable to room sizes, costs, amenities provided, and the number of beds
21 provided, is unlawful and has resulted in the defendants' failure to provide full and
22 equal accommodations, advantages, facilities, privileges and/or services to the
23 Plaintiffs.

24 **II. SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION: VIOLATION OF THE UNRUH CIVIL**
25 **RIGHTS ACT (On behalf of Plaintiff and Against All Defendants) (Cal Civ § 51-53)**

26 10. The Defendants are persons who either own, operate, lease or lease to a
27 place of public accommodation or business establishment. As such, the Defendants are
28 required to (1) ensure that all construction, alteration, or modification is barrier free and

1 complies with the Americans with Disabilities Act Accessibility Guidelines
2 ("ADAAG") and Title 24 of the California Code of Regulations (aka "California
3 Building Code"); and (2) remove all existing barriers where such removal is "readily
4 achievable." The Defendants have failed to meet these obligations. The Defendants
5 intended the physical and architectural condition of their property. The existence of
6 readily achievable removed barriers and barriers in violation of the ADAAG and/or
7 California Building Code, including, but not limited to, the accessible rooms in the
8 Hotel were not dispersed among the various classes of sleeping accommodations to
9 provide a range of options applicable to room sizes, costs, amenities provided, and the
10 number of beds provided, is unlawful and has resulted in the defendants' failure to
11 provide full and equal accommodations, advantages, facilities, privileges and/or
12 services to the Plaintiff.

13 11. The acts alleged above, which form the basis of the Plaintiff's discrimination
14 claim, are intentional acts.

15 **III. THIRD CAUSE OF ACTION: VIOLATION OF THE CALIFORNIA**
16 **DISABLED PERSONS ACT** (On behalf of Plaintiff and Against All
17 Defendants) (Cal Civ § 54-54.8)

18 12. The Defendants are persons who either own, operate, lease or lease to a place
19 of public accommodation or a facility open to the public. As such, the Defendants are
20 required to (1) ensure that all construction, alteration, or modification is barrier free and
21 complies with the Americans with Disabilities Act Accessibility Guidelines
22 ("ADAAG") and Title 24 of the California Code of Regulations (aka "California
23 Building Code"); and (2) remove all existing barriers where such removal is "readily
24 achievable." The Defendants have failed to meet these obligations. The existence of
25 readily achievable removed barriers and barriers in violation of the ADAAG and/or
26 California Building Code, including, but not limited to, the accessible rooms in the
27 Hotel were not dispersed among the various classes of sleeping accommodations to
28 provide a range of options applicable to room sizes, costs, amenities provided, and the
number of beds provided, is unlawful and has resulted in the defendants' failure to

1 provide full and equal accommodations, advantages, facilities, privileges and/or
2 services to the Plaintiff.

3 **IV. FOURTH CAUSE OF ACTION: NEGLIGENCE** (On behalf of Plaintiff and
4 Against All Defendants)

5 13. The Defendants had a general duty and a duty arising under the Americans
6 with Disabilities Act and the Unruh Civil Rights Act and California Disabled Persons
7 Act to provide safe, convenient, and accessible facilities to the Plaintiffs in the running
8 of their Hotel. Their breach of this duty, as alleged in the preceding paragraphs, has
9 caused injury and damage as alleged above.

10 **PRAYER:**

11 Wherefore, Plaintiff prays that this court award damages and provide relief as
12 follows:

13 1. For injunctive relief, compelling Defendants to comply with the Americans
14 with Disabilities Act and the Unruh Civil Rights Act. **Note:** the Plaintiff is not
15 invoking section 55 of the California Civil Code and is not seeking injunctive relief
16 under that section.

17 2. Damages under the Unruh Civil Rights Act and/or the California Disabled
18 Persons Act. **Note:** A Defendant cannot be held liable for damages under both the
19 Unruh Civil Rights Act and the California Disabled Persons Act and the Plaintiff will
20 make an election at trial depending upon the evidence amassed.

21 3. Reasonable attorneys' fees, litigation expenses and costs of suit, pursuant to
22 42 U.S.C. § 12205; Cal. Civ. Code §§ 52 and 54.3 and Cal. Civ. Proc. § 1021.5.

23 Dated: July 11, 2008

CENTER FOR DISABILITY ACCESS, LLP

24
25 By: 

26 MARK D. POTTER
27 Attorneys for Plaintiff
28

**UNITED STATES
DISTRICT COURT**
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN DIEGO DIVISION

**# 154338 - TC
* * C O P Y * *
August 21, 2008
13:58:59**

Civ Fil Non-Pris

USAO #: 08CV1547

Judge.: LARRY A BURNS

Amount.: \$350.00 CK

Check#: BC5433

Total-> \$350.00

FROM: LENETTE BARKER
VS
COLONY CONSOLIDATED

JS 44 (Rev. 12/07)

CIVIL COVER SHEET

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON THE REVERSE OF THE FORM.)

I. (a) PLAINTIFFS

LENETTE BARKER

(b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff SAN DIEGO
(EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)

(c) Attorney's (Firm Name, Address, and Telephone Number)

Mark D. Potter, Esq., Center for Disability Access, LLP, 100 E. San Marcos Blvd., #400, San Marcos, CA 92069-2988

DEFENDANTS

COLONY CONSOLIDATED, LP

County of Residence of First Listed Defendant Orange

NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE LAND INVOLVED.

Attorneys (If Known)

Tina I. Mangarpan, Esq., Ford, Walker, Haggerty & Behar, One World Trade Ctr., 27th Fl., Long Beach, CA 90831-2700

II. BASIS OF JURISDICTION (Place an "X" in One Box Only)

- ☐ 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff
- ☒ 3 Federal Question (U.S. Government Not a Party)
- ☐ 2 U.S. Government Defendant
- ☐ 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III)

III. CITIZENSHIP OF PRINCIPAL PARTIES (Place an "X" in One Box for Plaintiff and One Box for Defendant)

- | | | | | | |
|---|----------------------------|----------------------------|---|----------------------------|----------------------------|
| | PTF | DEF | | PTF | DEF |
| Citizen of This State | <input type="checkbox"/> 1 | <input type="checkbox"/> 1 | Incorporated or Principal Place of Business In This State | <input type="checkbox"/> 4 | <input type="checkbox"/> 4 |
| Citizen of Another State | <input type="checkbox"/> 2 | <input type="checkbox"/> 2 | Incorporated and Principal Place of Business In Another State | <input type="checkbox"/> 5 | <input type="checkbox"/> 5 |
| Citizen or Subject of a Foreign Country | <input type="checkbox"/> 3 | <input type="checkbox"/> 3 | Foreign Nation | <input type="checkbox"/> 6 | <input type="checkbox"/> 6 |

IV. NATURE OF SUIT (Place an "X" in One Box Only)

<input type="checkbox"/> 110 Insurance <input type="checkbox"/> 120 Marine <input type="checkbox"/> 130 Miller Act <input type="checkbox"/> 140 Negotiable Instrument <input type="checkbox"/> 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment <input type="checkbox"/> 151 Medicare Act <input type="checkbox"/> 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excl. Veterans) <input type="checkbox"/> 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits <input type="checkbox"/> 160 Stockholders' Suits <input type="checkbox"/> 190 Other Contract <input type="checkbox"/> 195 Contract Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 196 Franchise	PERSONAL INJURY <input type="checkbox"/> 310 Airplane <input type="checkbox"/> 315 Airplane Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 320 Assault, Libel & Slander <input type="checkbox"/> 330 Federal Employers' Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 340 Marine <input type="checkbox"/> 345 Marine Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 350 Motor Vehicle <input type="checkbox"/> 355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 360 Other Personal Injury	PERSONAL INJURY <input type="checkbox"/> 362 Personal Injury - Med. Malpractice <input type="checkbox"/> 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability PERSONAL PROPERTY <input type="checkbox"/> 370 Other Fraud <input type="checkbox"/> 371 Truth in Lending <input type="checkbox"/> 380 Other Personal Property Damage <input type="checkbox"/> 385 Property Damage Product Liability	<input type="checkbox"/> 610 Agriculture <input type="checkbox"/> 620 Other Food & Drug <input type="checkbox"/> 625 Drug Related Seizure of Property 21 USC 881 <input type="checkbox"/> 630 Liquor Laws <input type="checkbox"/> 640 R.R. & Truck <input type="checkbox"/> 650 Airline Regs. <input type="checkbox"/> 660 Occupational Safety/Health <input type="checkbox"/> 690 Other	<input type="checkbox"/> 422 Appeal 28 USC 158 <input type="checkbox"/> 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 PROPERTY RIGHTS <input type="checkbox"/> 820 Copyrights <input type="checkbox"/> 830 Patent <input type="checkbox"/> 840 Trademark	<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment <input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust <input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking <input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce <input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation <input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations <input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit <input type="checkbox"/> 490 Cable/Sat TV <input type="checkbox"/> 810 Selective Service <input type="checkbox"/> 850 Securities/Commodities/Exchange <input type="checkbox"/> 875 Customer Challenge 12 USC 3410 <input type="checkbox"/> 890 Other Statutory Actions <input type="checkbox"/> 891 Agricultural Acts <input type="checkbox"/> 892 Economic Stabilization Act <input type="checkbox"/> 893 Environmental Matters <input type="checkbox"/> 894 Energy Allocation Act <input type="checkbox"/> 895 Freedom of Information Act <input type="checkbox"/> 900 Appeal of Fee Determination Under Equal Access to Justice <input type="checkbox"/> 950 Constitutionality of State Statutes
REAL PROPERTY <input type="checkbox"/> 210 Land Condemnation <input type="checkbox"/> 220 Foreclosure <input type="checkbox"/> 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment <input type="checkbox"/> 240 Torts to Land <input type="checkbox"/> 245 Tort Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 290 All Other Real Property	CIVIL RIGHTS <input type="checkbox"/> 441 Voting <input type="checkbox"/> 442 Employment <input type="checkbox"/> 443 Housing/Accommodations <input type="checkbox"/> 444 Welfare <input type="checkbox"/> 445 Amer. w/Disabilities - Employment <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 446 Amer. w/Disabilities - Other <input type="checkbox"/> 440 Other Civil Rights	PRISONER PETITIONS <input type="checkbox"/> 510 Motions to Vacate Sentence <input type="checkbox"/> 530 General Habeas Corpus <input type="checkbox"/> 535 Death Penalty <input type="checkbox"/> 540 Mandamus & Other <input type="checkbox"/> 550 Civil Rights <input type="checkbox"/> 555 Prison Condition	<input type="checkbox"/> 710 Fair Labor Standards Act <input type="checkbox"/> 720 Labor/Mgmt. Relations <input type="checkbox"/> 730 Labor/Mgmt. Reporting & Disclosure Act <input type="checkbox"/> 740 Railway Labor Act <input type="checkbox"/> 790 Other Labor Litigation <input type="checkbox"/> 791 Empl. Ret. Inc. Security Act IMMIGRATION <input type="checkbox"/> 462 Naturalization Application <input type="checkbox"/> 463 Habeas Corpus - Alien Detainee <input type="checkbox"/> 465 Other Immigration Actions	SOCIAL SECURITY <input type="checkbox"/> 861 HIA (1395ff) <input type="checkbox"/> 862 Black Lung (923) <input type="checkbox"/> 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) <input type="checkbox"/> 864 SSID Title XVI <input type="checkbox"/> 865 RSI (405(g)) FEDERAL TAX SUITS <input type="checkbox"/> 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff or Defendant) <input type="checkbox"/> 871 IRS—Third Party 26 USC 7609	

V. ORIGIN

(Place an "X" in One Box Only)

- ☐ 1 Original Proceeding
- ☒ 2 Removed from State Court
- ☐ 3 Remanded from Appellate Court
- ☐ 4 Reinstated or Reopened
- ☐ 5 Transferred from another district (specify)
- ☐ 6 Multidistrict Litigation
- ☐ 7 Appeal to District Judge from Magistrate Judgment

VI. CAUSE OF ACTION

Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you are filing (Do not cite jurisdictional statutes unless diversity):
42 U.S.C.S. 12101, et seq.

Brief description of cause:
Plaintiff alleges violation of ADA

VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:

☐ CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER F.R.C.P. 23

DEMAND \$

CHECK YES only if demanded in complaint:

JURY DEMAND: ☒ Yes ☐ No

VIII. RELATED CASE(S) IF ANY

(See instructions):

JUDGE

DOCKET NUMBER

DATE

08/20/2008

SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY OF RECORD

Tina I. Mangarpan

FOR OFFICE USE ONLY

RECEIPT # 154338 AMOUNT \$350

APPLYING IFP

JUDGE

MAG. JUDGE

TAC 8/21/08